Price: #1.00

THE STATES assembled on Tuesday, 18th June 1991 at 9.30 a.m. under the Presidency of the Bailiff, Sir Peter Crill, C.B.E.

All Members were present with the exception of -

Senator Anne Baal - ill.
Robin Ernest Richard Rumboll, Deputy of St. Helier - out of the Island.
Derek Ryder Maltwood, Deputy of St.
Mary - out of the Island.
David Leon Crespel, Deputy of St.
Helier - out of the Island.

Prayers read by the Greffier

La Caroline, La Grande Rue, St. Mary: report of the Special Committee

The Bailiff presented to the States a report of the Special Committee appointed ``to inquire into the course of events which led to the Island Development Committee's approving an application from Oak Tree Developments Limited to establish a haulage, plant hire and demolition contractors' depot at La Caroline, St. Mary" (P.15/91).

THE STATES ordered that the said report be printed and distributed.

Subordinate legislation tabled

The following enactments were laid before the States, namely -

1. Motor Vehicles (Driving Licences) (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Order 1991. R & O 8213.

- 2. Road Vehicles (Registration Marks) (Amendment No. 6) (Jersey) Order 1991. R & O 8214.
- 3. Wine and Made-Wine (Revenue Duty) (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Order 1991. R & O 8215.
- 4. Gorey Fête (Jersey) Order 1991. R & O 8216.
- 5. St. Clement Fête (Jersey) Order 1991. R & O 8217.

Establishment Committee: resignation and appointment of member

THE STATES noted the resignation of Deputy Thomas James Jordan of St. Brelade from the Establishment Committee and approved the appointment of Deputy David Leon Crespel of St. Helier to that Committee

Telecommunications Board report for 1990

The Telecommunications Board by Act dated 31st May 1991, presented to the States its report for the year 1990.

THE STATES ordered that the said report be printed and distributed.

Probation Service report for 1990

The Prison Board by Act dated 26th April 1991, presented to the States the report of the Probation Service for 1990.

THE STATES ordered that the said report be printed and distributed.

Jersey Women's Refuge: report and accounts for 1990

The Defence Committee by Act dated 17th May 1991, presented to the States the annual report and accounts of the Jersey Women's Refuge for 1990.

THE STATES ordered that the said report be printed and distributed.

Matters noted - land transactions

THE STATES noted an Act of the Finance and Economics Committee dated 10th June 1991, showing that in pursuance of Standing Orders relating to certain transactions in land, the Committee had approved -

- (a) as recommended by the Island Development Committee, with the support of the Housing Committee, the purchase from Mrs. Ruth Young née Holmes, of No. 1 Commercial Buildings, St. Helier for the sum of #115,000, plus the payment of all legal fees;
- (b) as recommended by the Housing Committee and with the support of the Island Development Committee, the purchase -
 - (i) from Mrs. Phyllida May Campbell, née Gowing, of No. 74 Colomberie, St. Helier, for the sum of #138,000;
 - (ii) from Columbus Holdings Limited of No.76 Colomberie, St. Helier, for the sum of #123,000;
 - (iii) from Mr. Douglas Naidoo, of Nos. 78 and 82 Colomberie, St. Helier, for the sum of #92,000;
 - (iv) From Mrs. Felisha Le Vesconte, née Naidoo, and Mrs. Marguerite June Dreux, née Naidoo, of No. 80 Colomberie, St. Helier for the sum of #52,500;

plus the payment of all legal fees.

Matters lodged

The following subjects were lodged ``au Greffe" -

 Draft Sea-Fisheries (Miscellaneous Provisions) (Amendment No. 4) (Jersey) Regulations 199. P.97/91.
 Presented by the Agriculture and Fisheries Committee.

- Draft Tourism (Amendment No. 6)
 (Jersey) Law 199 . P.98/91.

 Presented by the Tourism
 Committee.
- 3. Criminal injuries compensation scheme: amendment. P.99/91. Presented by the Defence Committee.
- Golf course, Les Creux, St. Brelade. P.101/91.
 Presented by the Finance and Economics Committee.

Social Security contributions. Question and answer

Senator Corrie Stein asked Deputy Terence Augustine Le Sueur, President of the Social Security Committee, the following question -

"On what grounds are States' Members required to pay full self-employed social security contributions on their States' allowance?"

The President of the Social Security Committee replied as follows -

"As a former member of the Social Security Committee the Senator is no doubt aware of the basic rules of the present social security contribution scheme. However for the benefit of the House as a whole may I remind Members of a few key elements.

All persons living in the Island between the ages of 15 and 65 (or 60 in certain cases) are liable to pay social security contributions, either in Class 1 or in Class 2. Broadly speaking, Class 1 relates to employed persons, while Class 2 relates to the self-employed or non-employed.

The only persons between those ages, resident in the Island, who are NOT liable to pay social security contributions are -

- (a) married women who opt out;
- (b) widows in receipt of widow's benefit;
- (c) persons undergoing full-time

education or training;

- (d) persons undergoing imprisonment;
- (e) temporary residents in the Island for less than six months not engaged in employment under Class 1;
- (f) persons with a small income exemption;
- (g) persons in receipt of unemployment credits or certain other benefits:
- (h) persons over the age of 60 not in gainful employment who elect to opt out.

Accordingly, in answer to the Senator's question, all States' Members under the age of 60 are obliged to pay social security contributions, just as the rest of the population, and equally they are entitled to share in the benefits those contributions provide, unless they fall into one of the above eight categories. Whether or not those who receive the States' allowance pay FULL social security contributions on that allowance will depend on the particular circumstances of each Member.

Under the terms of the Social Security Scheme it is clear that Class 1 contributions are payable by employees, i.e. those working for an employer under a master/servant relationship. All other persons are liable under Class 2, and I am confident, as well as being supported by legal opinion, that States' Members are not employees by virtue of their office, and in the absence of any other employer they therefore fall under the Class 2 classification. Those Members who are employees (earning over the current minimum of #307 a month) but who also claim part or all the States' allowance are NOT liable to pay ANY social security contribution on that allowance.

Members may be aware that all persons, including States' Members, liable to pay Class 2 contributions may elect to have their contributions reduced from the full standard rate, in relation to

their annual income as assessed by the Comptroller of Income Tax. These are commonly termed `earnings related contributions'. (Whilst accepting that the tax information may be somewhat historic, in these inflationary times this normally works to the benefit of the contributor). The States' allowance is regarded as part of a Member's income by the Comptroller of Income Tax, and hence also for Social Security.

It therefore depends on the individual circumstances of each Member whether or not they may be eligible for reduced rate contributions, but in the absence of any claim then clearly the Member is liable at the full rate. These facts were known when the original income support scheme was introduced, and the level of support was presumably intended to reflect this situation, although when that scheme was introduced it was based on the principle that a Member could spend up to half his week in gainful employment.

Members who have read the report of the sub-committee looking into the payment of an honorarium to States' Members will be aware of the recommendation in that report that any such honorarium or allowance be calculated in the knowledge that from such payment Members may have to meet their own responsibilities for social security contributions, extra health cover, secondary pension scheme and any other such costs and, for these reasons (amongst others), recommended that any honorarium or allowance be set at a sufficient level to reflect these costs.

I hope, and I am sure this hope is shared by most Members, that the House Committee will be bringing forward in the near future a report and proposition on the subject of Members' income in order that we may improve on the present anachronistic scheme."

Social Security registration cards. Questions and answers

Senator Terence John Le Main asked Deputy Michael Adam Wavell, President of the Defence Committee the following questions -

- "1. Will the President confirm that the debate on 14th November 1989 on Projet 43/89 regarding photographs on social security registration cards, came to an end when, in his then capacity as Vice-President of the Defence Committee, he gave an assurance that the Committee would undertake to review the whole question of photographs on Social Security cards?
- 2. With regard to the answer given by the President, when can the States receive a full report on this issue from his Committee?"

The President of the Defence Committee replied as follows -

- "1. Yes. Whilst accepting that a full review has not been carried out, nevertheless, I have taken the opportunity to discuss the issue of identity cards with the chief officers of Social Security, Immigration, the States of Jersey Police and the Policy and Resources Committee. Today, I am happy if it is the States' wish to state the consensus of their views and to give you the advice they have given me to date.
- 2. We are at present in a very fluid state, it needs very, very deep consideration. There are constitutional matters involved in it. It is not just the matter that the Senator is asking for, it is not just photographs on Social Security cards, he effectively is asking for identity cards and for the Island to introduce a system of identification and that has many ramifications and that needs serious in-depth discussions."

Gorey Day Care Centre, Field 77, Le Chemin des Maltières, Grouville: approval of drawings THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Public Health Committee -

- (a) approved Drawings Nos. 1740/8A, 9, 10, 12, and 14A showing the construction of a day care centre for elderly people on Field 77, Le Chemin des Maltières, Gorey;
- (b) authorized the Greffier of the States to sign the said Drawings on behalf of the States.

Category A housing developme transfer of administration

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Island Development Committee -

approved the transfer of administration, to the Housing Committee, of the properties, listed in the attached schedule, acquired specifically to provide Category A housing accommodation.

Schedule

Norman's Timber Yard, Pier Road, St. Helier 3 and 7 Wesley Street, St. Helier 361/2 Belmont Road, St. Helier The Halt, St. Clement Mal Assis Mill, Grands Vaux, St. Helier 6, 11, 12 and 13 Lempriere Street, St. Helier 57 Great Union Road, St. Helier Eastleigh, Plat Douet Road, St. Saviour Pierson Court, St. Helier 2, 2a and 2b St. Clement's Road, St. Helier Westview, Plat Douet Road, St. Saviour Edinburgh Guest House, St. Helier 24, 26, 28 and 281/2 Albert Street, St. Helier 3 Clearview Street, St. Helier Cleveland Garages, David Place, St. Helier Beau Vallon Hotel, St. Helier C.T.V. site, St. Helier Ritz Hotel, St. Helier Fields 769/770, Longueville, St. Saviour Field 1367, La Route du Petit Clos, St. Helier Field 355A, Grouville

Fields 553/554, La Moye, St. Brelade Fields 14/14A, St. Clement 25-27 St. James Street, St. Helier.

Amendment (No. 13) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey, P.84/91

THE STATES, in pursuance of Articles 16 and 27 of the States of Jersey Law 1966 as amended, made a Standing Order entitled Amendment (No. 13) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey.

Continental Hotel and adjoining properties, St. Helier: purchase. P.87/91

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Island Development Committee -

- (a) agreed to purchase on behalf of the public from The Continental Hotel Limited the property known as the Continental Hotel, St. Saviour's Road, No. 22, St. Saviour's Road, a passageway nine feet in width, Nos. 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 Brook Cottages, garage (formerly a stable), Nos. 8, 10, 10½, 12, 14, 14A, 14B, 18, 18A and 20 Ann Street, and their appurtenances, in the Parish of St. Helier, shown on Drawing No. 288/1, for the sum of #2,600,000, with each party being responsible for the payment of its own legal fees, the purchase to be subject to a satisfactory ground survey being undertaken to confirm the site's suitability for the construction of Category A housing;
- (b) authorized the payment or discharge of the expenses to be incurred in connexion with the acquisition of the said land from the Island Development Committee's vote of credit ``Acquisition of Land - Major Reserve" (Vote No. C0904);
- (c) authorized the Attorney General and the Greffier of the States to pass, on behalf of the public, any contracts which it is found necessary to pass in connexion

with the said properties and any interest therein.

Act establishing a scheme to subsidise certain dental care. P.90/91

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Social Security Committee approved an Act establishing a scheme to subsidise certain dental care.

Jersey Dental Scheme Board of Management: appointment of chairman. P.91/91

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Social Security Committee, in accordance with Article 5 of the Act of the States of 18th June 1991, establishing a scheme to subsidise certain dental care, appointed Mr. James Shaw as chairman of the Board of Management.

Dental care for priority groups. P.96/91

THE STATES, having adopted an amendment of Senator Corrie Stein that after the words ``and single parents" there should be inserted ``and persons on low incomes", adopted the proposition of Senator Richard Joseph Shenton, as amended, and instructed the Social Security Committee, as a matter of urgency, to present to the States proposals for a further scheme to subsidise dental care and making provision for ``priority" groups including, in particular, pregnant and nursing mothers, the elderly and single parents and persons on low incomes.

Amendment (No. 9) of Standing Orders Relating to Certain Transactions in Land. P.92/91

THE STATES, in pursuance of Article 27 of the States of Jersey Law 1966, as amended, made a Standing Order entitled Amendment (No. 9) of Standing Orders Relating to Certain Transactions in Land.

Draft Merchant Shipping (Deck Officers) (Jersey) Regulations 199.

P.93/91

Draft Merchant Shipping (Marine Engineer Officers and Marine Engine Operators) (Jersey) Regulations 199 . P.94/91

THE STATES acceded to the request of the President of the Harbours and Airport Committee that the draft Merchant Shipping (Deck Officers) (Jersey) Regulations 199 (lodged on 4th June 1991) and the draft Merchant Shipping (Marine Engineer Operators and Marine Engine Operators) (Jersey) Regulations 199 (lodged on 4th June 1991) be deferred from the present Sitting to a later date.

27 Hill Street/16 Queen Street, St. Helier: supplementary vote of credit. P.70/91

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of the Finance and Economics Committee acceded to the request for the following supplementary vote of credit to be voted out of the general reserve -

Public Services Committee 2082 - Public buildings 27 Hill Street/ 16 Queen Street #111,000.

THE STATES rose at 11.25 a.m.

R.S. GRAY

Greffier of the States.